

The `rebuttal` package *

Sergiu Deitsch
sergiu.deitsch@gmail.com

November 14, 2024

Abstract

The `rebuttal` L^AT_EX package provides means for writing structured journal and conference paper rebuttals.

1 Introduction

A well-structured rebuttal typically consists of the following parts:

1. a master list of referee comments and author's replies, and
2. clearly highlighted changes to the manuscript that stem from reviewers' comments.

The `rebuttal` provides markup to support authors in producing the above content in a consistent manner.

2 Usage

The following sections provide an overview of the package's functionality for structuring rebuttals and annotating manuscripts.

2.1 Structuring the Rebuttal

`rebuttal` (*env.*) The package defines the `rebuttal` environment that can contain several blocks `comment` (*env.*) that refer to editor's or specific reviewers' comments and your replies to referees' `answer` (*env.*) comments. Specifically, the environment accepts an optional [*title*] and is expected to contain a `comment` and an `answer` environment. The general layout looks as follows:

```
\begin{rebuttal}[Editor's Comments]
  \begin{comment}
    % Reviewer's comment
  \end{comment}
  \begin{answer}
    % The reply
  \end{answer}
\end{rebuttal}
```

*This document corresponds to `rebuttal` v0.1.1, dated 2024-11-14.

2.2 Annotating Changes to the Manuscript

`\addition` Within the manuscript, three main commands can be used to denote additions, deletions, or changes. The corresponding commands are `\addition[<options>]{<text>}`, `\deletion[<options>]{<text>}`, and `\change[<options>]{<old text>}{<new text>}`. While `\addition` and `\deletion` require a single argument. `\change` expects two arguments, where the first one denotes the changed text, and the second one the new text.

All three commands require specifying their labels for referencing the modifications using the *<label>* option. Additionally, the *<ref>* option back references the original reviewer comment and may specify multiple labels, e.g.,

```
\addition[label=a:new,ref={c:c1,c:c2}]{new text}.
```

2.3 Annotating Multiple Paragraphs

`additionenv` (*env.*) Additionally to the provided markup commands, the package also defines equivalent `changeenv` (*env.*) environments for annotating multiple paragraphs:

`deletionenv` (*env.*)

```
\begin{additionenv}[label=a:par,ref=c:missing-motivations]
  \section{New Experiment}
  % new text
\end{additionenv}

\begin{changeenv}[label=ch:par,ref=c:missing-motivations]{old text}
  \section{Improved Experiment}
  % new text
\end{changeenv}

\begin{deletionenv}[label=d:par,ref=c:missing-motivations]
  \section{Useless Discussion}
  % old text
\end{deletionenv}
```

2.4 Disabling Annotations

`\rebuttalset` Once a manuscript has been accepted for publication, rebuttal annotations are no longer necessary and only the accepted changes should be typeset. `rebuttal` allows to disable annotations using the `\rebuttalset` command by disabling the *<marked>* option, i.e.,

```
\rebuttalset{marked=false}
```

which will disable the annotations in the current group.

3 Known Limitations

Rebuttal markup cannot be used within floating environments such as `figure` and `table`, and the `\caption` command.

4 Implementation

4.1 Package

```
1 (*package)
```

We need to load additional color sets.

```
2 \PassOptionsToPackage{dvipsnames,svgnames,x11names}{xcolor}
```

Package dependencies.

```
3 \RequirePackage{calc}
```

```
4 \RequirePackage{environ}
```

```
5 \RequirePackage{etoolbox}
```

```
6 \RequirePackage{marginnote}
```

```
7 \RequirePackage{pgfkeys}
```

```
8 \RequirePackage{soul}
```

```
9 \RequirePackage{tikz}
```

```
10 \RequirePackage{todonotes}
```

```
11 \RequirePackage{ulem}
```

```
12 \RequirePackage{xcolor}
```

```
13 \RequirePackage{xstring}
```

```
14
```

```
15 \AtEndPreamble{
```

```
16   \RequirePackage{pdfcomment}
```

```
17 }
```

```
18
```

```
19 \ifx\counterwithin\@undefined
```

```
20 \RequirePackage{chngcntr}
```

```
21 \fi
```

`\rebuttal@triangle` The following command is used to generate a triangle in the left margin.

```
22 \newcommand\rebuttal@triangle{%
```

```
23   \begingroup
```

```
24   \ifx\tikzexternaldisable\@undefined\else
```

```
25     \tikzexternaldisable
```

```
26   \fi
```

```
27   \begin{tikzpicture}[x=.5em,y=.5em]
```

```
28     \fill[/rebuttal/answer/label] (0,0) -- (0,1) -- (.75,.5) -- cycle;
```

```
29   \end{tikzpicture}%
```

```
30   \endgroup
```

```
31 }
```

`\rebuttal@decbookmarklevel` Unless `hyperref` was not loaded, the command decrements the current bookmark level.

```
32 \newcommand\rebuttal@decbookmarklevel{%
```

```
33   \ifx\Hy@currentbookmarklevel\@undefined\else
```

```
34     \@tempcnta\Hy@currentbookmarklevel
```

```
35     \advance\@tempcnta by -1 %
```

```
36     \xdef\Hy@currentbookmarklevel{\the\@tempcnta}%
```

```
37   \fi
```

```
38 }
```

`\rebuttal@incbookmarklevel` Unless `hyperref` was not loaded, the command increments the current bookmark level.

```
39 \newcommand\rebuttal@incbookmarklevel{%
```

```

40 \ifx\Hy@currentbookmarklevel\@undefined\else
41   \@tempcnta\Hy@currentbookmarklevel
42   \advance\@tempcnta by 1 %
43   \xdef\Hy@currentbookmarklevel{\the\@tempcnta}%
44 \fi
45 }

46 \newif\ifrebuttal@marked
47 \newif\ifrebuttal@nohyperlinks
48 \newif\ifrebuttal@refbreak
49 \newif\ifrebuttal@twocolumn
50
51 \pgfkeys{
52   /rebuttal/.is family,
53   /rebuttal/execute on begin/.initial=,
54   /rebuttal/execute on end/.initial=,
55   /rebuttal/no hyperlinks/.is if=rebuttal@nohyperlinks,
56   /rebuttal/no hyperlinks=false,
57   /rebuttal/marked/.is if=rebuttal@marked,
58   /rebuttal/marked=true,
59   /rebuttal/title/font/.store in=\rebuttal@titlefont,
60   /rebuttal/title/font=\normalfont\bfseries,
61   /rebuttal/title/format/.code=#1:,
62   /rebuttal/change/from command/.store in=\rebuttal@changefrom,
63   /rebuttal/change/from command=\sout,
64   /rebuttal/change/from color/.code={\colorlet{rebuttal@change@from}{#1}},
65   /rebuttal/change/from color=DodgerBlue3!50,
66   /rebuttal/deletion/command/.store in=\rebuttal@delete,
67   /rebuttal/deletion/command=\xout,
68   /rebuttal/comment/font/.store in=\rebuttal@commentfont,
69   /rebuttal/comment/font=\normalfont\itshape,
70   /rebuttal/comment/label/font/.store in=\rebuttal@commentlabelfont,
71   /rebuttal/comment/label/font=\normalfont\rmfamily\bfseries,
72   /rebuttal/answer/font/.store in=\rebuttal@answerfont,
73   /rebuttal/answer/font=\normalfont,
74   /rebuttal/answer/label/.store in=\rebuttal@answerlabel,
75   /rebuttal/answer/label={\rebuttal@triangle},
76   /rebuttal/answer/label/font/.store in=\rebuttal@answerlabelfont,
77   /rebuttal/answer/label/font=\normalfont,
78   /rebuttal/answer/label/.style={black!65},
79   /rebuttal/reference/font/.store in=\rebuttal@referencefont,
80   /rebuttal/reference/font={%
81     \tiny\bfseries%
82   },
83   % TODO does not work within \todo
84   /rebuttal/reference/.code={%
85     %},
86 }
87
88 \let\rebuttalanswerlabel\rebuttal@answerlabel
89
90 \newrobustcmd\rebuttal@reference[1]{%
91   \begingroup
92   \rebuttal@referencefont

```

```

93 \begin{tabular}{@{}c@{}}
94   \begingroup
95     \color{rebuttal@#1}%
96     \MakeUppercase{\rebuttal@id}%
97     \csname therebuttal#1\endcsname
98   \endgroup
99   \ifrebuttal@refbreak
100     %%
101   \else
102     \enspace
103   \fi
104   \normalfont
105   % Reset color (TODO Maybe allow to modify the color)
106   \color{black}%
107   (\pgfkeys{/rebuttal/#1/ref/all})%
108 \end{tabular}%
109 \endgroup
110 }
111
112 \newcommand\rebuttal@define@keys[2]{
113   \pgfkeys{
114     /rebuttal/#1/label/.initial=,
115     /rebuttal/#1/label/.value required,
116     /rebuttal/#1/break/.is if=rebuttal@refbreak,
117     /rebuttal/#1/ref/.initial=,
118     /rebuttal/#1/ref/.value required,
119     /rebuttal/#1/ref/create/.code={
120       \ifrebuttal@nohyperlinks
121         \ref*{##1}%
122       \else
123         \ref{##1}%
124       \fi
125     },
126     /rebuttal/#1/ref/all/.code={%
127       \pgfkeysgetvalue{/rebuttal/#1/ref}\rebuttal@currefs
128       \edef\rebuttal@tmp{\rebuttal@currefs}%
129       \foreach
130         [
131           %expand list,
132           count=\ri from 0,
133         ]
134         \r in \rebuttal@tmp {%
135           \ifnum\ri > 0\relax
136             ,\,%
137           \fi
138           \pgfkeys{/rebuttal/#1/ref/create=\r}%
139         }%
140     },
141     /rebuttal/#1/color/.code={\colorlet{rebuttal@#1}{##1}},
142     /rebuttal/#1/color=#2,
143     /rebuttal/#1/font/.value required,
144     /rebuttal/#1/font/.code={
145       \expandafter\def\csname rebuttal@#1@font\endcsname{##1}%
146     },

```

```

147     /rebuttal/#1/font=\normalfont\mdseries,
148   }
149 }
150
151 \rebuttal@define@keys{addition}{RedViolet}
152 \rebuttal@define@keys{deletion}{Firebrick3}
153 \rebuttal@define@keys{change}{DodgerBlue3}
154
155 \newlength\rebuttal@textwidth
156 \newlength\rebuttal@hskip
157
158 \newcommand\rebuttal@command[3]{%
159   \newcounter{rebuttal#1}%
160   \AtEndPreamble{%
161     \ifpackageloaded{cleveref}{%
162       \crefname{rebuttal#1}{#1}{#1s}%
163     }{%
164     }%
165   % Marked version with full output
166   \expandafter\newcommand\csname #1\endcsname [#3] []{%
167     \ifrebuttal@marked
168       \stepcounter{rebuttalchanges}%
169       \refstepcounter{rebuttal#1}%
170       \begingroup
171         \tikzset{notestyloraw/.append style={
172           inner sep=\z@,
173           rounded corners=\z@,
174         }}%
175         \pgfqkeys{/rebuttal/#1}{##1}%
176         \label{\pgfkeysvalueof{/rebuttal/#1/label}}%
177         \colorlet{Changes@Color}{rebuttal@#1}%
178         \begingroup

```

Main content.

```

179         #2%
180       \endgroup
181       \StrLeft{#1}{1}[\rebuttal@id]%
182       \ifx\tikzexternaldisable\@undefined\else
183         \tikzexternaldisable
184       \fi

```

Shrink to text.

```

185       \settoheight\rebuttal@textwidth{\rebuttal@reference{#1}}%
186       \tikzset{notestyloraw/.append style={text width=\rebuttal@textwidth}}%

```

Place labels in left margin at the same distance as on the right.

```

187       \setlength\rebuttal@hskip{\marginparwidth}%
188       \addtolength\rebuttal@hskip{-\rebuttal@textwidth}%
189       \let\old@xmpar\@xmpar

```

Hook into L^AT_EX kernel command since `\if@firstcolumn` is not unreliable because margin notes are floats.

```

190       \renewcommand\@xmpar[2] []{%
191         \old@xmpar[\hspace*\rebuttal@hskip]###1}{###2}%
192       }%

```

```

193     \todo
194     [
195         backgroundcolor=none,
196         bordercolor=none,
197         linecolor=rebuttal@#1,
198         %size=\tiny,
199     ]{%
200         \rebuttal@reference{#1}%
201         %\pgfkeys{/rebuttal/reference=#1}
202     }%
203     \endgroup
204     \else
205         #2%
206     \fi
207 }%
208 }

```

additionenv (*env.*) Provide an equivalent environment for the `\addition` command.

```

209 \NewEnviron{additionenv}[1] [] {%
210     \addition[#1]{\BODY}%
211 }%

```

changeenv (*env.*) Provide an equivalent environment for the `\change` command.

```

212 \NewEnviron{changeenv}[2] [] {%
213     \change[#1]{#2}{\BODY}%
214 }%

```

deletionenv (*env.*) Provide an equivalent environment for the `\deletion` command.

```

215 \NewEnviron{deletionenv}[1] [] {%
216     \deletion[#1]{\BODY}%
217 }%

```

```

218 \newcommand\rebuttal@added[1] {%
219     \ifrebuttal@marked
220         \rebuttal@addition@font%
221         \textcolor{rebuttal@addition}{#1}%
222     \else
223         #1%
224     \fi
225 }
226
227 \newcommand\rebuttal@deleted[1] {%
228     \ifrebuttal@marked
229         \rebuttal@deletion@font%
230         \textcolor{rebuttal@deletion}{\rebuttal@delete{#1}}%
231     \fi
232 }
233
234 \newcommand\rebuttal@replaced[2] {%
235     \ifrebuttal@marked
236         \rebuttal@change@font%
237         \textcolor{rebuttal@change@from}{\rebuttal@changefrom{#1}}%
238         \allowbreak
239         \textcolor{rebuttal@change}{#2}%

```

```

240 \else
241   #2%
242 \fi
243 }
244
245 \rebuttal@command{addition}{\rebuttal@added{#2}}{2}
246 \rebuttal@command{deletion}{\rebuttal@deleted{#2}}{2}
247 \rebuttal@command{change}{\rebuttal@replaced{#2}{#3}}{3}
248
249 \newcounter{rebuttalcomments}
250 \newcounter{rebuttalchanges}
251
252 \newcounter{rebuttal}
253 \newcounter{rebuttalcomment}
254 \newcounter{rebuttalanswer}
255
256 \renewcommand\therebuttalcomment{%
257   \arabic{rebuttal}.\arabic{rebuttalcomment}%
258 }
259
260 \let\theHrebuttalcomment\therebuttalcomment
261
262 \renewcommand\therebuttalanswer{%
263   \therebuttalcomment%
264 }
265
266 \counterwithin*{rebuttalcomment}{rebuttal}%
267 \counterwithin*{rebuttalanswer}{rebuttalcomment}%
268
269 \newdimen\rebuttal@labelsep

```

`\rebuttal@startlinkguard` Disable hyperlinks if NoHyper environment is available.

```

270 \newcommand\rebuttal@startlinkguard{%
271   \ifx\NoHyper\undefined\else
272     \ifrebuttal@nohyperlinks
273       \begin{NoHyper}%
274         \fi
275       \fi
276 }

```

`\rebuttal@startlinkguard` End of disable hyperlinks if NoHyper environment is available.

```

277 \newcommand\rebuttal@endlinkguard{
278   \ifx\endNoHyper\undefined\else
279     \ifrebuttal@nohyperlinks
280       \end{NoHyper}%
281     \fi
282   \fi
283 }

```

TODO Comment labels tooltips

`rebuttal` (*env.*) The main environment that defines the remaining ones.

```

284 \newenvironment{rebuttal}[1][ ]{%
285   \rebuttal@startlinkguard

```


Execute user code.

```
286 \pgfkeysvalueof{/rebuttal/execute on begin}%
287 \begingroup
288 \refstepcounter{rebuttal}%
289 \if@twocolumn
290   \onecolumn
```

Remember the layout.

```
291   \rebuttal@twocolumntrue
292 \else
293   \rebuttal@twocolumnfalse
294 \fi
295 \begingroup
296 \par
297 \addvspace{\bigskipamount}%
298 \ifstrempy{#1}{}{%
```

In case the current bookmark level is 0, we leave it as is. Otherwise, we increment the level to anchor the following bookmarks below the current bookmark. This ensures that the bookmark structure is correct even if the document either does not use or provides structuring commands (e.g., missing `\section` in a `scrlltr2` document).

```
299   \ifx\Hy@currentbookmarklevel\@undefined\else
300     \ifnum\Hy@currentbookmarklevel>0
301       \@tempcnta\Hy@currentbookmarklevel
302       \advance\@tempcnta by 1 %
303       \xdef\Hy@currentbookmarklevel{\the\@tempcnta}%
304     \fi
305   \fi
306   \ifx\currentpdfbookmark\@undefined\else
307     \currentpdfbookmark{#1}{rebuttalcomment.\therebuttalcomment}%
308   \fi
309   \noindent\bgroup\rebuttal@titlefont\strut
310   \pgfkeys{/rebuttal/title/format=#1}\egroup%
311 }%
312 \par%
313 \@afterheading
314 \vspace*{\medskipamount}%
315 \begin{trivlist}%
316 \let\rebuttal@oldmakelabel\makelabel%
317 \renewcommand\makelabel[1]{\llap{\rebuttal@commentlabelfont ##1}}%
318 \labelwidth\z@
319 %\setlength{\parsep}{\smallskipamount}%
320 %\setlength{\labelsep}{1pt}%
321 %\setlength{\topsep}{\z@}%
322 %\setlength{\partopsep}{\bigskipamount}
323 \let\comment\@undefined
324 \let\endcomment\@undefined
325 \newenvironment{comment}{%
326   \rebuttal@incbookmarklevel
327   \apptocmd\@item{%
328     \ifx\currentpdfbookmark\@undefined\else
329       \currentpdfbookmark{Comment~\therebuttalcomment}{rebuttalcomment.\therebuttalcomment}
330     \fi
```

```

331 }{%
332   \PackageInfo{rebuttal}{The \string\@item\space command was patched to
333     provide comment bookmarks.}%
334 }{%
335   \PackageWarning{rebuttal}{Failed to patch the \string\@item\space command.
336     Bookmarks may not be displayed correctly.}%
337 }%
Do not allow to place answers within a comment by undefining the answer environ-
ment
338 \let\answer\@undefined
339 \let\endanswer\@undefined
340 \stepcounter{rebuttalcomments}%
341 \refstepcounter{rebuttalcomment}
342 %\settowidth{\labelwidth}{\rebuttal@commentlabelfont #1}
343 %\addtolength{\labelwidth}{1em}
344 \item
345 [%
346   \therebuttalcomment%
347 ]%
348 \begingroup
349 \rebuttal@commentfont
350 \let\makelabel\rebuttal@oldmakelabel
351 }{%
352   \endgroup
353   \rebuttal@decbookmarklevel
354 }
355 \newenvironment{answer}{%
356   \par\medskip
357   \@afterheading
358   \rebuttal@incbookmarklevel
359   \begin{trivlist}
360     \ifx\belowpdfbookmark\@undefined\else
361       \belowpdfbookmark{Answer to~\therebuttalcomment}{rebuttalanswer.\therebuttalanswer}%
362     \fi
363     \normalfont\rebuttal@answerfont%
364     \rebuttal@labelsep\labelsep%
365     \newcommand\rebuttal@makelabel[1]{\rebuttal@answerlabelfont #####1\enspace}
366     \renewcommand\makelabel[1]{\rebuttal@makelabel{#####1}}%
367     \labelsep\z@
368     \labelwidth\z@
369     \let\makelabel\empty
370     %\settowidth\labelwidth{\rebuttal@makelabel{\rebuttal@answerlabel}}%
371     \item
372     [%
373       \ifx\pdftooltip\@undefined
374         \llap{\rebuttal@answerlabel\enspace}%
375       \else
376         \llap{\pdftooltip{\rebuttal@answerlabel}{Reply}\enspace}%
377       \fi
378     ]%
379     \begingroup
380     \labelsep\rebuttal@labelsep
381     \refstepcounter{rebuttalanswer}%

```

```

382 }{%
383   \endgroup
384   \end{trivlist}%
385   \rebuttal@decbookmarklevel
386 }
387 }{%
388   \end{trivlist}%
389   \rebuttal@decbookmarklevel
390   \endgroup
391   \par\addvspace{\bigskipamount}%
392   \ifrebuttal@twocolumn

```

Restore the layout.

```

393   \twocolumn
394   \fi
395   \endgroup

```

Execute user code.

```

396   \pgfkeysvalueof{/rebuttal/execute on end}%
397   \rebuttal@endlinkguard
398 }

```

Support cleveref.

```

399 \AtEndPreamble{%
400   \@ifpackageloaded{cleveref}{%
401     \crefname{rebuttalcomment}{comment}{comments}
402     \crefname{rebuttalanswer}{answer}{answers}
403     \Crefname{rebuttalcomment}{Comment}{Comments}
404     \Crefname{rebuttalanswer}{Answer}{Answers}
405   }{}
406 }

```

```

407

```

```

408 \newcommand\rebuttaltotalcomments{%
409   \textbf{??}%

```

```

410   \@latex@warning{Reference \string\rebuttaltotalcomments\space on page \thepage\space undefi
411 }

```

```

412

```

```

413 \newcommand\rebuttaltotalchanges{%
414   \textbf{??}%

```

```

415   \@latex@warning{Reference \string\rebuttaltotalchanges\space on page \thepage\space undefin
416 }

```

```

417

```

```

418 \AtEndDocument{%

```

```

419   \immediate\write\@auxout{%

```

```

420     \gdef\string\rebuttaltotalcomments{\arabic{rebuttalcomments}}%

```

```

421     \gdef\string\rebuttaltotalchanges{\arabic{rebuttalchanges}}%

```

```

422   }

```

```

423 }

```

`\rebuttalset` $\langle options \rangle$ Allows to update package options.

```

424 \newcommand\rebuttalset[1]{%
425   \pgfqkeys{/rebuttal}{#1}%
426 }
427 \end{package}

```

4.2 Example

```
428 (*example1)
429 \documentclass[american,version=last,fromphone,fromemail,svgnames,dvipsnames,x11names]{scrlettr}
430 \usepackage[T1]{fontenc}
431 \usepackage[utf8]{inputenc}
432 \usepackage[babel]{csquotes}
433 \usepackage{babel}
434 \usepackage{graphicx}
435 \usepackage{microtype}
436 \usepackage{lipsum}
437 \usepackage{rebuttal}
438 \usepackage{varioref}
439 \usepackage{hyperref}
440 \usepackage{cleveref}
441
442 \hypersetup{colorlinks=true}
443
444 \setkomavar{fromname}{Jane Smith}
445 \setkomavar{fromaddress}{%
446   Pattern Recognition Lab\\
447   University of Erlangen-Nürnberg
448 }
449 \setkomavar{backaddress}{}
450 \setkomavar{fromphone}{+49\, (0)\, 12345678}
451 \setkomavar{fromemail}{firstname.lastname@fau.de}
452 \setkomavar{place}{Erlangen}
453
454 \begin{document}
455
456 \setkomavar{subject}{Manuscript: Extended Field of View in C-Arm Computed
457   Tomography for Weight-Bearing Imaging}
458
459 \begin{letter}{Medical Physics}
460
461 \opening{Dear Prof. Jones, Dear Prof. Taylor,}
462
463 We thank you for considering our submission as a research article for Medical
464 Physics. We also thank the reviewers for the thoughtful comments. We have
465 carefully revised the document and prepared a point-by-point response to the
466 reviewer's comments.
467
468 The major changes to the paper are:
469 \begin{itemize}
470   \item Clarification of the medical impact
471   \item An extension of the evaluation and discussion to 3D Cone Beam CT and
472     off-center positioning of the object
473   \item Inclusion of more substantive figure captions
474 \end{itemize}
475
476 Below, you will find the reviewers' comments in blue, our response in normal
477 face and additions to the manuscript in quotes and \enquote{italic face.} Note
478 that we omitted footnotes and references in the quotations.
479
```

```

480 We are looking forward to hearing from you.
481
482 \closing{With kind regards,}
483
484 \end{letter}
485 \include{rebuttal}
486 \end{document}
487 \end{example1}

488 (*example2)
489 \documentclass{article}
490 \usepackage{rebuttal}
491 \usepackage[colorlinks]{hyperref}
492 \usepackage{lipsium}
493 \usepackage{cleveref}
494
495 \begin{document}
496 \section{Test}
497 \input{rebuttal}
498 \end{document}
499 \end{example2}

500 (*rebuttal-comments)
501
502 The following pages contain a list of editor's and reviewers' comments followed
503 by our replies. The comments are sequentially numbered and associated either
504 with the editor or the corresponding reviewer. The replies may contain
505 references to changes in the original manuscript which are identified by a label
506 consisting of a running number and followed by the label of the original comment
507 in parentheses. The label back references the original reviewer comment within
508 the manuscript. For instance, the reference \textbf{C2~(1.3)}, which is typeset
509 in the manuscript margin, refers to the second change stemming from the third
510 comment of the first reviewer.
511
512 \begin{rebuttal}[Editor's Comments]
513   \begin{comment}
514     The topic of this manuscript is of interest. We concur with the summary review
515     of the associate editor and the reviews of the referees. The authors should
516     thoroughly address all of the comments, below, in a revised manuscript.
517   \end{comment}
518
519 \end{rebuttal}
520
521 \begin{rebuttal}[Specific Comments]
522   \begin{comment}
523     \label{c:specific}
524     You need to include figure captions that make your figures intelligible.
525     See~\cref{a:foo} and \cref{c:foo2}.
526   \end{comment}
527
528   \begin{answer}
529     The reviewer is right. We have reworked the figure captions to make the
530     figures more independent of the text. Furthermore, check if lists are
531     typeset correctly:
532     \begin{itemize}

```

```

533     \item One
534     \item Two
535     \begin{enumerate}
536     \item Three
537     \item Four
538     \end{enumerate}
539 \end{itemize}
540 \end{answer}
541
542 \begin{comment}
543 \label{c:c2}
544 Are you going to pay for color in the print article? If not, the lines are
545 not intelligible in Figures 2, 5, 11. In addition to color coding for the
546 digital version, you could make lines with distinct patterns (dots, dashes,
547 etc.) so they are distinct in monochrome presentations.
548 \end{comment}
549
550 \begin{answer}
551 We agree with this point and we are sorry that we missed this in the first
552 version of the article. The article will appear as an online only version
553 and is part of the special issue associated with this year's CT Meeting
554 conference. Thus there will be no additional cost associated with color
555 figures. Nonetheless, we agree that all figures need to be correct in
556 grey-scale as some readers might print the article. According to the
557 reviewer's comment, we have adjusted the figures by using different patterns
558 and gray levels.
559
560 (Refer also to \cref{c:specific} for more information.)
561 \end{answer}
562 \end{rebuttal}
563
564 \lipsum[1] \addition[label=a:foo,ref=c:specific]{\lipsum[2]} \lipsum[3]
565
566 \lipsum[4] \deletion[label=a:foo1,ref=c:c2]{An unintended addition.}
567 and a \change[label=c:foo2,ref=c:c2]{from}{to} change. And another addition
568 \addition[label=a:foo3,ref=c:c2]{here}.
569 Also \addition[label=a:foo4,ref=c:c2]{here}.
570 Maybe \addition[label=a:foo5,ref=c:c2]{here}.
571 Additionally \addition[label=a:foo6,ref=c:c2]{here}.
572 Additionally \addition[label=a:foo7,ref=c:c2]{here}.
573
574 \begin{additionenv}[label=d:par,ref=c:c2]
575 \begin{itemize}
576 \item \lipsum[1]
577 \end{itemize}
578 \lipsum[2]
579 \end{additionenv}
580
581 Additional notes:
582 \begin{itemize}
583 \item Multiple source references can be
584 \addition[label=a:foo8,ref={c:specific,c:c2}]{specified}.
585 \item If the references do not fit into a single line in the margin, you may
586 force a \addition[label=a:break,ref={c:specific,c:c2},break]{break}.

```

587 `\end{itemize}`
588 `\rebuttal-comments`

Change History

v0.1.0 – 2024-11-01	rebuttal : Fixed incorrect bookmark structure	8
General: Initial release		1
v0.1.1 – 2024-11-14		
General: Improved documentation		1

Index

Numbers written in *italic* refer to the page where the corresponding entry is described; numbers underlined refer to the code line of the definition; numbers in **roman** refer to the code lines where the entry is used.

Symbols	B	
<code>\,</code>	<code>\begin</code>	<code>deletionenv (env.)</code> 215
<code>\@afterheading</code>	93, 273, 315, 359,	<code>\documentclass</code> 429, 489
<code>\@auxout</code>	454, 459, 469,	E
<code>\@ifpackageloaded</code>	495, 512, 513,	<code>\edef</code> 128
.	521, 522, 528,	<code>\egroup</code> 310
<code>\@item</code>	532, 535, 542,	<code>\empty</code> 369
<code>\@latex@warning</code>	550, 574, 575, 582	<code>\end</code> 29, 108,
<code>\@tempcnta</code>	<code>\belowpdfbookmark</code>	280, 384, 388,
. 360, 361	474, 484, 486,
34, 35, 36, 41,	<code>\bfseries</code> 60, 71, 81	498, 517, 519,
42, 43, 301, 302, 303	<code>\bgroup</code> 309	526, 538, 539,
<code>\@undefined</code>	<code>\bigskipamount</code>	540, 548, 561,
. 297, 322, 391	562, 577, 579, 587
33, 40, 182, 271,	<code>\BODY</code> 210, 213, 216	<code>\endanswer</code> 339
278, 299, 306,	C	<code>\endcomment</code> 324
323, 324, 328,	<code>\change</code> 213, 567	<code>\endcsname</code> 97, 145, 166
338, 339, 360, 373	<code>changeenv (env.)</code> 212	<code>\endNoHyper</code> 278
<code>\@xmpar</code> 189, 190	<code>\closing</code> 482	<code>\enquote</code> 477
A	<code>\color</code> 95, 106	<code>\enspace</code> 102, 365, 374, 376
<code>\addition</code>	<code>\colorlet</code> 64, 141, 177	environments:
.	<code>\comment</code> 323	<code>additionenv</code> 209
210, 564,	<code>\counterwithin</code>	<code>changeenv</code> 212
568, 569, 570, 19, 266, 267	<code>deletionenv</code> 215
571, 572, 584, 586	<code>\cref</code> 525, 560	<code>rebuttal</code> 284
<code>additionenv (env.)</code> 209	<code>\Crefname</code> 403, 404	<code>\expandafter</code> 145, 166
<code>\addtolength</code> 188, 343	<code>\Crefname</code> 162, 401, 402	F
<code>\addvspace</code> 297, 391	<code>\csname</code> 97, 145, 166	<code>\fill</code> 28
<code>\advance</code> 35, 42, 302	<code>\currentpdfbookmark</code>	<code>\foreach</code> 129
<code>\allowbreak</code> 238 306, 307, 328, 329	G
<code>\answer</code> 338	D	<code>\gdef</code> 420, 421
<code>\apptocmd</code> 327	<code>\deletion</code> 216, 566	
<code>\arabic</code> 257, 420, 421		
<code>\AtEndDocument</code> 418		
<code>\AtEndPreamble</code>		
. 15, 160, 399		

H			
<code>\hspace</code>	191	<code>\NoHyper</code>	271
<code>\Hy@currentbookmarklevel</code>	33, 34, 36, 40, 41, 43, 299, 300, 301, 303	<code>\noindent</code>	309
<code>\hypersetup</code>	442	<code>\normalfont</code> 60, 69, 71, 73, 77, 104, 147, 363	
I		O	
<code>\if@twocolumn</code>	289	<code>\old@xmpar</code>	189, 191
<code>\ifnum</code>	135, 300	<code>\onecolumn</code>	290
<code>\ifrebuttal@marked</code>	46, 167, 219, 228, 235	<code>\opening</code>	461
<code>\ifrebuttal@nohyperlinks</code>	47, 120, 272, 279	P	
<code>\ifrebuttal@refbreak</code>	48, 99	<code>\PackageInfo</code>	332
<code>\ifrebuttal@twocolumn</code>	49, 392	<code>\PackageWarning</code>	335
<code>\ifstrempy</code>	298	<code>\par</code>	296, 312, 356, 391
<code>\immediate</code>	419	<code>\parsep</code>	319
<code>\include</code>	485	<code>\partopsep</code>	322
<code>\input</code>	497	<code>\PassOptionsToPackage</code>	2
<code>\item</code>	344, 371, 470, 471, 473, 533, 534, 536, 537, 576, 583, 585	<code>\pdffoottip</code>	373, 376
<code>\itshape</code>	69	<code>\pgfkeys</code>	51, 107, 113, 138, 201, 310
L		<code>\pgfkeysgetvalue</code>	127
<code>\label</code>	176, 523, 543	<code>\pgfkeysvalueof</code>	176, 286, 396
<code>\labelsep</code>	320, 364, 367, 380	<code>\pgfqkeys</code>	175, 425
<code>\labelwidth</code>	318, 342, 343, 368, 370	R	
<code>\lipsum</code> 564, 566, 576, 578		<code>\r</code>	134, 138
<code>\llap</code>	317, 374, 376	<code>rebuttal (env.)</code>	284
M		<code>\rebuttal@added</code> 218, 245	
<code>\makelabel</code>	316, 317, 350, 366, 369	<code>\rebuttal@addition@font</code>	220
<code>\MakeUppercase</code>	96	<code>\rebuttal@answerfont</code>	72, 363
<code>\marginparwidth</code>	187	<code>\rebuttal@answerlabel</code>	74, 88, 370, 374, 376
<code>\mdseries</code>	147	<code>\rebuttal@answerlabelfont</code>	76, 365
<code>\medskip</code>	356	<code>\rebuttal@change@font</code>	236
<code>\medskipamount</code>	314	<code>\rebuttal@change@font</code>	62, 237
N		<code>\rebuttal@command</code>	158, 245, 246, 247
<code>\newcounter</code> 159, 249, 250, 252, 253, 254		<code>\rebuttal@commentfont</code>	68, 349
<code>\newdimen</code>	269	<code>\rebuttal@commentlabelfont</code>	70, 317, 342
<code>\NewEnviron</code> 209, 212, 215		<code>\rebuttal@currrefs</code>	127, 128
<code>\newlength</code>	155, 156	<code>\rebuttal@decbookmarklevel</code>	32, 353, 385, 389
<code>\newrobustcmd</code>	90	<code>\rebuttal@define@keys</code>	112, 151, 152, 153
		<code>\rebuttal@delete</code> 66, 230	
		<code>\rebuttal@deleted</code>	227, 246
		<code>\rebuttal@deletion@font</code>	229
		<code>\rebuttal@endlinkguard</code>	277, 397
		<code>\rebuttal@hskip</code>	156, 187, 188, 191
		<code>\rebuttal@id</code>	96, 181
		<code>\rebuttal@incbookmarklevel</code>	39, 326, 358
		<code>\rebuttal@labelsep</code>	269, 364, 380
		<code>\rebuttal@makelabel</code>	365, 366, 370
		<code>\rebuttal@oldmakelabel</code>	316, 350
		<code>\rebuttal@reference</code>	90, 185, 200
		<code>\rebuttal@referencefont</code>	79, 92
		<code>\rebuttal@replaced</code>	234, 247
		<code>\rebuttal@startlinkguard</code>	270, 277, 285
		<code>\rebuttal@textwidth</code>	155, 185, 186, 188
		<code>\rebuttal@titlefont</code>	59, 309
		<code>\rebuttal@tmp</code>	128, 134
		<code>\rebuttal@triangle</code>	22, 75
		<code>\rebuttal@twocolumnfalse</code>	293
		<code>\rebuttal@twocolumntrue</code>	291
		<code>\rebuttalanswerlabel</code> 88	
		<code>\rebuttalset</code>	424
		<code>\rebuttaltotalchanges</code>	413, 415, 421
		<code>\rebuttaltotalcomments</code>	408, 410, 420
		<code>\ref</code>	121, 123
		<code>\refstepcounter</code>	169, 288, 341, 381
		<code>\relax</code>	135
		<code>\renewcommand</code>	190,
		256, 262, 317, 366	
		<code>\RequirePackage</code>	4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9,
		10, 11, 12, 13, 16, 20	
		<code>\ri</code>	132, 135
		<code>\rmfamily</code>	71

S		U	
<code>\section</code>	496	<code>\textcolor</code> 221, 230, 237, 239
<code>\setkomavar</code> 444, 445, 449, 450, 451, 452, 456	<code>\theHrebuttalcomment</code>	260
<code>\setlength</code>	187, 319, 320, 321, 322	<code>\thepage</code>	410, 415
<code>\settowidth</code> 185, 342, 370		<code>\therebuttalanswer</code>	262, 361
<code>\smallskipamount</code> ..	319	<code>\therebuttalcomment</code> . 256, 260, 263, 307, 329, 346, 361	
<code>\sout</code>	63	<code>\tikzexternaldisable</code>	24, 25, 182, 183
<code>\space</code> 332, 335, 410, 415		<code>\tikzset</code>	171, 186
<code>\stepcounter</code> ..	168, 340	<code>\tiny</code>	81, 198
<code>\string</code>	332, 335, 410, 415, 420, 421	<code>\todo</code>	83, 193
<code>\StrLeft</code>	181	<code>\topsep</code>	321
<code>\strut</code>	309	<code>\twocolumn</code>	393
T		V	
<code>\textbf</code>	409, 414, 508	<code>\vspace</code>	314
W		X	
Z		<code>\write</code>	419
Z		<code>\xdef</code>	36, 43, 303
Z		<code>\xout</code>	67
Z		<code>\z@</code>	172, 173, 318, 321, 367, 368